Item 10:

Consider and Take Appropriate Action on Adoption of Proposed New 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, Subchapter C, Middle School Certificate Standards, and Subchapter D, Secondary School Certificate Standards

DISCUSSION AND ACTION

SUMMARY: This item provides the State Board for Educator Certification (SBEC) an opportunity to adopt, subject to State Board of Education (SBOE) review, proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, Subchapter C, Middle School Certificate Standards, and Subchapter D, Secondary School Certificate Standards. Proposed new 19 TAC §§235.1, General Requirements, 235.11, Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3, 235.19, Implementation Date, Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3, 235.41, Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Grades 4-8, 235.59, Implementation Date, Grades 4-8, 235.61, Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Grades 7-12, and 235.89, Implementation Date, Grades 7-12, would implement recent legislation from the 85th Texas Legislative Session, 2017, specify the pedagogy and professional responsibilities (PPR) educator standards required for classroom teacher certification, and clarify the implementation date for the new standards. The proposed new chapter reflects feedback provided by the SBEC-appointed Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee for the Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3, Grades 4-8 (4-8), and Grades 7-12 (7-12) PPR standards. No changes are recommended since published as proposed, but additional changes may be recommended at the time of the meeting based on public comment.

STATUTORY AUTHORITY: The statutory authority for proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235 is Texas Education Code (TEC), §§21.003(a); 21.031; and 21.041(a) and (b)(1), (2), and (4); and 21.0489, as added by Senate Bill (SB) 1839 and House Bill (HB) 2039, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2017, for Subchapter A; TEC, §§21.031, 21.040(4), and 21.041(b)(1), (2), and (4), for Subchapter B; TEC, §§21.031, 21.040(4), and 21.041(b)(1), (2), and (4), for Subchapter D.

TEC, §21.003(a), states that a person may not be employed as a teacher, teacher intern or teacher trainee, librarian, educational aide, administrator, educational diagnostician, or school counselor by a school district unless the person holds an appropriate certificate or permit issued as provided by the TEC, Chapter 21, Subchapter B.

TEC, §21.031, charges the SBEC with regulating and overseeing all aspects of the certification, continuing education, and standards of conduct for public school educators to ensure that all candidates for certification demonstrate the knowledge and skills necessary to improve the performance of the diverse student population of this state.

TEC, §21.040(4), states that the SBEC shall, for each class of educator certificate, appoint an advisory committee composed of members of that class to recommend standards for that class to the board.

TEC, §21.041(a), authorizes the SBEC to adopt rules as necessary to implement its procedures. TEC, §21.041(b)(1), requires the SBEC to propose rules that provide for the regulation of educators and the general administration of the TEC, Chapter 21, Subchapter B, in a manner consistent with the TEC, Chapter 21, Subchapter B. TEC, §21.041(b)(2) and (4), require the SBEC to propose rules that specify the classes of educator certificates to be issued, including emergency certificates, and the requirements for the issuance and renewal of an educator certificate.

TEC, §21.0489, as added by SB 1839 and HB 2039, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2017, requires the SBEC to create a prekindergarten-Grade 3 certificate.

EFFECTIVE DATE: The proposed effective date of the proposed new 19 TAC §§235.1, 235.11, 235.19, 235.41, 235.59, 235.61, and 235.89 would be March 8, 2018 (20 days after filing as adopted with the *Texas Register*). The proposed effective date is also based on the SBEC and SBOE meeting schedules.

PREVIOUS BOARD ACTION: At the October 6, 2017 SBEC meeting, the SBEC approved new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, Subchapter C, Middle School Certificate Standards, and Subchapter D, Secondary School Certificate Standards, for publication in the *Texas Register* as proposed rules.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND JUSTIFICATION: The SBEC is statutorily authorized to regulate and oversee all aspects of the certification of public school educators. SBEC is also statutorily authorized to ensure that all candidates for certification or renewal of certification demonstrate the knowledge and skills necessary to improve the performance of the diverse population of this state.

At the March and June 2017 SBEC meetings, the Board and Texas Education Agency (TEA) staff discussed the desire to establish the educator standards for the classroom teacher into rule and to provide grade-band focused PPR educator standards that are aligned with 19 TAC Chapter 149, Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards, and the commissioner-recommended appraisal instrument to better prepare beginning teachers. Attachment III includes an updated action plan/timeline of activities for the PPR work. At the June 9, 2017 SBEC meeting, the Board approved the Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee to begin the work of recommending PPR standards for the grade bands: EC-3, 4-8, and 7-12. Attachment III also provides the names of the committee members and a summary of the selection process. The subcommittee for each grade band was convened to prioritize and provide feedback on the current teacher standards in 19 TAC Chapter 149.

At the August 4, 2017 SBEC meeting, TEA staff updated the SBEC on the activities completed by the advisory committee, presented the Board with the PPR standards the committee was recommending, and next steps for adopting the standards in rule. At the October 6, 2017 meeting, the SBEC approved new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Subchapters A-D, for publication in the *Texas Register* as proposed rules.

The SBEC rules in proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, Subchapter C, Middle School Certificate Standards, and Subchapter D, Secondary School Certificate Standards, specify the educator standards for the classroom teacher class of certificates. The educator standards are the basis for educator preparation program (EPP) design to effectively prepare beginning classroom teachers and the foundation for the certification examinations. The proposed standards provide for more rigorous, relevant, and reliable requirements for the preparation, certification, and testing of classroom teachers upon entry into the profession and retention of these qualified professionals.

Following is a description of proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, included in Attachment II, that implements recent legislation, reflects SBEC direction, establishes educator standards in rule, and incorporates feedback from the SBEC-appointed advisory committee for the PPR educator standards for the classroom teacher by grade bands: EC-3, 4-8, and 7-12. The numbering of the proposed rule text provides room for future adoption in rule of additional educator standards for the classroom teacher class. Item 12 in this agenda, Proposed New 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, provides the SBEC with an opportunity to discuss and propose EC-3 Content Standards, EC-3 Science of Teaching Reading Standards, and EC-Grade 6 PPR Standards.

Subchapter A. General Provisions

§235.1. General Requirements

Proposed new subsection (a) would clarify that the standards identified in this chapter must be used by EPPs in the development of curricula and coursework as well as serve as the basis for the classroom teacher certification examinations. Proposed new subsection (b) would clarify that the standards underlying the content certification examinations are aligned with the Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills curriculum adopted by the State Board of Education to demonstrate the connection between what students are expected to know and the knowledge and skill expectations of the teachers who are instructing the students. Proposed new subsection (c) would clarify that all candidates for standard certification must pass the appropriate examination(s) prior to issuance of a standard certificate.

Subchapter B. Elementary School Certificate Standards

Proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Subchapter B, would incorporate all elementary school classroom teacher certificate standards under one subchapter.

Division 1. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3

Proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Subchapter B, Division 1, Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3, is being proposed to comply with TEC, §21.0489, as added by SB 1839 and HB 2039, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2017. The proposed new rule would specify the PPR educator standards required of candidates seeking the EC-3 classroom teacher certificate.

§235.11. <u>Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Early Childhood:</u> Prekindergarten-Grade 3

Proposed new subsection (a) would clarify the PPR standards for EC-3 for classroom teachers of early learners and are aligned with classroom teaching expectations as outlined in 19 TAC Chapter 149, Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards. Proposed new subsection (b) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to plan and deliver instruction. Proposed new subsection (c) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to ensure high levels of learning, social-emotional development, and achievement outcomes for all students, taking into consideration each student's educational and developmental backgrounds and focusing on each student's needs. Proposed new subsection (d) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's content knowledge and expertise. Proposed new subsection (e) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to manage a safe and supportive learning environment. Proposed new subsection (f) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to apply datadriven practices. Proposed new subsection (g) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to abide by educator professional practices and responsibilities.

§235.19. Implementation Date, Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3

The proposed new section would clarify that the provisions of this subchapter apply to candidates admitted to an EPP on or after September 1, 2018.

Subchapter C. Middle School Certificate Standards

Proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Subchapter C, would incorporate all middle school classroom teacher certificate standards under one subchapter.

§235.41. Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Grades 4-8

Proposed new subsection (a) would clarify the PPR standards for classroom teachers of students in Grades 4-8 and are aligned with classroom teaching expectations as outlined in 19 TAC Chapter 149, Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards. Proposed new subsection (b) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to plan and deliver instruction. Proposed new subsection (c) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to ensure high levels of learning and achievement outcomes for all students, taking into consideration each student's educational and developmental backgrounds and focusing on each student's needs. Proposed new subsection (d) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's content knowledge and expertise. Proposed new subsection (e) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to manage a safe and supportive learning environment. Proposed new subsection (f) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to apply data-driven practices. Proposed new subsection (g) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to abide by educator professional practices and responsibilities.

§235.59. Implementation Date, Grades 4-8

The proposed new section would clarify that the provisions of this subchapter apply to candidates admitted to an EPP on or after September 1, 2018.

Subchapter D. Secondary School Certificate Standards

Proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Subchapter D, would incorporate all secondary school classroom teacher certificate standards under one subchapter.

§235.61. Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Grades 7-12

Proposed new subsection (a) would clarify the PPR standards for classroom teachers of students in Grades 7-12 and are aligned with classroom teaching expectations as outlined in 19 TAC Chapter 149, Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards. Proposed new subsection (b) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to plan and deliver instruction. Proposed new subsection (c) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to ensure high levels of learning and achievement outcomes for all students, taking into consideration each student's educational and developmental backgrounds and focusing on each student's needs. Proposed new subsection (d) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's content knowledge and expertise. Proposed new subsection (e) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to manage a safe and supportive learning environment. Proposed new subsection (f) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to apply data-driven practices. Proposed new subsection (g) would specify the standards needed in regards to a teacher's ability to abide by educator professional practices and responsibilities.

§235.89. Implementation Date, Grades 7-12

The proposed new section would clarify that the provisions of this subchapter apply to candidates admitted to an EPP on or after September 1, 2018.

No changes are recommended to proposed new 19 TAC §§235.1, 235.11, 235.19, 235.41, 235.59, 235.61, and 235.89.

FISCAL IMPACT: The TEA staff has determined that there is no additional fiscal impact on state and local governments and there are no additional costs to entities required to comply with the proposed new rules. In addition, there is no direct adverse economic impact for small businesses, microbusinesses, and rural communities; therefore, no regulatory flexibility analysis, specified in Texas Government Code, §2006.002, is required. There is no effect on local economy; therefore, no local employment impact statement is required under Texas Government Code, §2001.002. The proposed new rules do not impose a cost on regulated persons, another state agency, a special district, or a local government and, therefore, are not subject to Texas Government Code, §2001.0045.

GOVERNMENT GROWTH IMPACT: The TEA staff has determined that the proposed new rules do not have a government growth impact pursuant to Texas Government Code, §2001.0221.

PUBLIC AND STUDENT BENEFIT: The public and student benefit anticipated as a result of the proposed new rules would be more rigorous, relevant, and reliable requirements for the preparation, certification, and testing of classroom teachers upon entry into the profession and retention of these qualified professionals. The proposed new rules do not impose a cost on persons required to comply with the rules.

PROCEDURAL AND REPORTING IMPLICATIONS: The proposed new rules would have no additional procedural and reporting implications.

LOCALLY MAINTAINED PAPERWORK REQUIREMENTS: The proposed new rules would have no additional locally maintained paperwork requirements.

PUBLIC COMMENTS: The public comment period on the proposal began November 3, 2017, and ended December 4, 2017. Any comments received will be provided to the SBEC under separate cover prior to the December 8, 2017 meeting. The SBEC will take registered oral and written comments on this item at the December 8, 2017 meeting in accordance with the SBEC board operating policies and procedures.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION: I recommend that the State Board for Educator Certification:

Approve for adoption, subject to State Board of Education review, proposed new 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, Subchapter C, Middle School Certificate Standards, and Subchapter D, Secondary School Certificate Standards, with an effective date of 20 days after filing the adoption notice with the Texas Register.

Staff Members Responsible: Grace Wu, Project Manager

Educator Support

Jessica McLoughlin, Program Specialist Educator Support

Attachments: I. Statutory Citations

II. Text of Proposed New 19 TAC Chapter 235, <u>Classroom Teacher Certification Standards</u>, Subchapter A, <u>General Provisions</u>, Subchapter B, <u>Elementary School Certificate Standards</u>, Subchapter C, <u>Middle School Certificate Standards</u>, and Subchapter D, <u>Secondary School Certificate Standards</u>

III. Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee, Summary of Selection Process, and Updated Activities

ATTACHMENT I

Statutory Citations Relating to Proposed New 19 TAC Chapter 235, Classroom Teacher Certification Standards, Subchapter A, General Provisions, Subchapter B, Elementary School Certificate Standards, Subchapter C, Middle School Certificate Standards, and Subchapter D, Secondary School Certificate Standards

Texas Education Code, §21.003, Certification Required (excerpt):

(a) A person may not be employed as a teacher, teacher intern or teacher trainee, librarian, educational aide, administrator, educational diagnostician, or school counselor by a school district unless the person holds an appropriate certificate or permit issued as provided by Subchapter B.

Texas Education Code, §21.031, Purpose:

- (a) The State Board for Educator Certification is established to recognize public school educators as professionals and to grant educators the authority to govern the standards of their profession. The board shall regulate and oversee all aspects of the certification, continuing education, and standards of conduct of public school educators.
- (b) In proposing rules under this subchapter, the board shall ensure that all candidates for certification or renewal of certification demonstrate the knowledge and skills necessary to improve the performance of the diverse student population of this state.

Texas Education Code, §21.040, General Powers and Duties of Board (excerpt):

The board shall:

(4) for each class of educator certificate, appoint an advisory committee composed of members of that class to recommend standards for that class to the board:

Texas Education Code, §21.041, Rules; Fees (excerpts):

- (b) The board shall propose rules that:
 - (1) provide for the regulation of educators and the general administration of this subchapter in a manner consistent with this subchapter;
 - (2) specify the classes of educator certificates to be issued, including emergency certificates;
 - (4) specify the requirements for the issuance and renewal of an educator certificate;

Texas Education Code, §21.0489, <u>Early Childhood Certification</u>, as added by Senate Bill 1839 and House Bill 2039, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2017:

- (a) To ensure that there are teachers with special training in early childhood education focusing on prekindergarten through grade three, the board shall establish an early childhood certificate.
- (b) A person is not required to hold a certificate established under this section to be employed by a school district to provide instruction in prekindergarten through grade three.
- (c) To be eligible for a certificate established under this section, a person must:

(1) either:

- (A) satisfactorily complete the course work for that certificate in an educator preparation program, including a knowledge-based and skills-based course of instruction on early childhood education that includes:
 - (i) teaching methods for:
 - (a) using small group instructional formats that focus on building social, emotional, and academic skills;
 - (b) navigating multiple content areas; and
 - (c) managing a classroom environment in which small groups of students are working on different tasks; and
 - (ii) strategies for teaching fundamental academic skills, including reading, writing, and numeracy; or
- (B) hold an early childhood through grade six certificate issued under this subchapter and satisfactorily complete a course of instruction described by Paragraph (A);
- (2) perform satisfactorily on an early childhood certificate examination prescribed by the board; and
- (3) satisfy any other requirements prescribed by the board.
- (d) The criteria for the course of instruction described by Subsection (c)(1)(A) shall be developed by the board in consultation with faculty members who provide instruction at institutions of higher education in educator preparation programs for an early childhood through grade six certificate.

ATTACHMENT II Text of Proposed New 19 TAC

Chapter 235. Classroom Teacher Certification Standards

Subchapter A. General Provisions

§235.1. General Requirements.

- (a) The knowledge and skills identified in this section must be used by an educator preparation program in the development of the curricula and coursework as prescribed in §228.30 of this title (relating to Educator Preparation Curriculum) and serve as the basis for developing the examinations as prescribed in §230.35 of this title (relating to Development, Approval, Implementation, and Evaluation of Teacher Certification Standards).
- (b) Unless provided otherwise in this title, the content area and grade level of a certificate category as well as the standards underlying the certification examination for each category are aligned with the Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills curriculum adopted by the State Board of Education, as prescribed in §233.1(c) of this title (relating to General Authority).
- (c) A person must satisfy all applicable requirements and conditions under this title and other law to be issued a certificate in a category. A person seeking an initial standard certification must pass the appropriate examination(s) as prescribed in §230.21 of this title (relating to Educator Assessment).

Subchapter B. Elementary School Certificate Standards

Division 1. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3

§235.11. Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3.

- Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 pedagogy and professional responsibilities (PPR) standards. The PPR standards identified in this section are targeted for classroom teachers of early learners (birth through age eight). The standards address the discipline that deals with the theory and practice of teaching to inform skill-based training and development. The standards inform proper teaching techniques, strategies, teacher actions, teacher judgements, and decisions by taking into consideration theories of learning, understandings of students and their needs, and the backgrounds and interests of individual students. The standards are also aligned with the Commissioner's Teacher Standards in 19 TAC Chapter 149 of this title (relating to Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards).
- (b) Instructional Planning and Delivery. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers
 demonstrate understanding of instructional planning and delivery by providing standards-based, datadriven, differentiated instruction that engages students and makes learning relevant for today's learners.
 Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) develop lessons that build coherently toward objectives based on course content, curriculum scope and sequence, and expected student outcomes;
 - (2) effectively communicate goals, expectations, and objectives to help all students reach high levels of achievement;
 - (3) connect students' prior understanding and real-world experiences to new content and contexts, maximizing learning opportunities;
 - (4) plan instruction that is developmentally appropriate, is standards driven, and motivates students to learn;
 - (5) differentiate instruction, aligning methods and techniques to diverse student needs, including acceleration, remediation, and implementation of individual education plans;

- (6) plan student groupings, including pairings and individualized and small-group instruction, to facilitate student learning;
- (7) integrate the use of oral, written, graphic, kinesthetic, and/or tactile methods to teach key concepts;
- (8) ensure that the learning environment features a high degree of student engagement by facilitating discussion and student-centered activities as well as leading direct instruction;
- (9) encourage all students to overcome obstacles and remain persistent in the face of challenges, providing them with support in achieving their goals;
- (10) set high expectations and create challenging learning experiences for students, encouraging them to apply disciplinary and cross-disciplinary knowledge to real-world problems;
- (11) provide opportunities for students to engage in individual and collaborative critical thinking and problem solving;
- (12) monitor and assess students' progress to ensure that their lessons meet students' needs;
- (13) provide immediate feedback to students in order to reinforce their learning and ensure that they understand key concepts; and
- (14) adjust content delivery in response to student progress through the use of developmentally appropriate strategies that maximize student engagement.
- (c) Knowledge of Student and Student Learning. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers work to ensure high levels of learning, social-emotional development, and achievement outcomes for all students, taking into consideration each student's educational and developmental backgrounds and focusing on each student's needs. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) create a community of learners in an inclusive environment that views differences in learning and background as educational assets;
 - (2) connect learning, content, and expectations to students' prior knowledge, life experiences, and interests in meaningful contexts;
 - (3) understand the unique qualities of students with exceptional needs, including disabilities and giftedness, and know how to effectively address these needs through instructional strategies and resources;
 - (4) understand the role of language and culture in learning and know how to modify their practice to support language acquisition so that language is comprehensible and instruction is fully accessible;
 - (5) understand how learning occurs and how learners develop, construct meaning, and acquire knowledge and skills; and
 - (6) identify readiness for learning and understand how development in one area may affect students' performance in other areas.
- (d) Content Knowledge and Expertise. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers exhibit an understanding of content, discipline, and related pedagogy as demonstrated through the quality of the design and execution of lessons and the ability to match objectives and activities to relevant state standards. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) have expertise in how their content vertically and horizontally aligns with the grade-level/subject area continuum, leading to an integrated curriculum across grade levels and content areas;
 - (2) identify gaps in students' knowledge of subject matter and communicate with their leaders and colleagues to ensure that these gaps are adequately addressed across grade levels and subject areas;
 - (3) keep current with developments, new content, new approaches, and changing methods of instructional delivery within their discipline;

- (4) organize curriculum to facilitate student understanding of the subject matter;
- (5) understand, actively anticipate, and adapt instruction to address common misunderstandings and preconceptions;
- (6) promote literacy and the academic language within the discipline and make discipline-specific language accessible to all learners;
- (7) teach both the key content knowledge and the key skills of the discipline; and
- (8) make appropriate and authentic connections across disciplines, subjects, and students' real world experiences.
- (e) Learning Environment. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers interact with students in respectful ways at all times, maintaining a physically and emotionally safe, supportive learning environment that is characterized by efficient and effective routines, clear expectations for student behavior, and organization that maximizes student learning. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) embrace students' backgrounds and experiences as an asset in their learning;
 - (2) maintain and facilitate respectful, supportive, positive, and productive interactions with and among students;
 - (3) establish and sustain learning environments that are developmentally appropriate and respond to students' needs, strengths, and personal experiences;
 - (4) create a physical classroom set-up that is flexible and accommodates the different learning needs of students;
 - (5) implement behavior management systems to maintain an environment where all students can learn effectively;
 - (6) maintain a culture that is based on high expectations for student performance and encourages students to be self-motivated, taking responsibility for their own learning;
 - (7) maximize instructional time, including managing transitions;
 - (8) manage and facilitate groupings in order to maximize student collaboration, participation, and achievement; and
 - (9) communicate regularly, clearly, and appropriately with parents and families about student progress, providing detailed and constructive feedback and partnering with families in furthering their students' achievement goals.
- (f) Data-Driven Practices. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers use formal and informal methods to assess student growth aligned to instructional goals and course objectives and regularly review and analyze multiple sources of data to measure student progress and adjust instructional strategies and content delivery as needed. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) gauge student progress and ensure mastery of content knowledge and skills by providing

 assessments aligned to instructional objectives and outcomes that are accurate measures of student
 learning;
 - (2) analyze and review data in a timely, thorough, accurate, and appropriate manner, both individually and with colleagues, to monitor student learning; and
 - (3) design instruction, change strategies, and differentiate their teaching practices to improve student learning based on assessment outcomes.
- (g) Professional Practices and Responsibilities. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers consistently hold themselves to a high standard for individual development, collaborate with other educational professionals, communicate regularly with stakeholders, maintain professional relationships,

- comply with all campus and school district policies, and conduct themselves ethically and with integrity. Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3 classroom teachers must:
- (1) reflect on their own strengths and professional learning needs, using this information to develop action plans for improvement;
- (2) seek out feedback from supervisor, coaches, and peers and take advantage of opportunities for jobembedded professional development;
- (3) adhere to the educators' code of ethics in §247.2 of this title (relating to Code of Ethics and Standard Practices for Texas Educators), including following policies and procedures at their specific school placement(s);
- (4) communicate consistently, clearly, and respectfully with all members of the campus community, administrators, and staff; and
- (5) serve as advocates for their students, focusing attention on students' needs and concerns and maintaining thorough and accurate student records.

§235.19. Implementation Date, Early Childhood: Prekindergarten-Grade 3.

The provisions of this subchapter apply to an applicant who is admitted to an educator preparation program for the Classroom Teacher Certificate on or after September 1, 2018.

Subchapter C. Middle School Certificate Standards

§235.41. Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Grades 4-8.

- (a) Grades 4-8 pedagogy and professional responsibilities (PPR) standards. The PPR standards identified in this section are targeted for classroom teachers of students in Grades 4-8. The standards address the discipline that deals with the theory and practice of teaching to inform skill-based training and development. The standards inform proper teaching techniques, strategies, teacher actions, teacher judgements, and decisions by taking into consideration theories of learning, understandings of students and their needs, and the backgrounds and interests of individual students. The standards are also aligned with the Commissioner's Teacher Standards in 19 TAC Chapter 149 of this title (relating to Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards).
- (b) Instructional Planning and Delivery. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers demonstrate understanding of instructional planning and delivery by providing standards-based, data-driven, differentiated instruction that engages students and makes learning relevant for today's learners. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) develop lessons that build coherently toward objectives based on course content, curriculum scope and sequence, and expected student outcomes;
 - (2) effectively communicate goals, expectations, and objectives to help all students reach high levels of achievement;
 - (3) connect students' prior understanding and real-world experiences to new content and contexts, maximizing learning opportunities;
 - (4) plan instruction that is developmentally appropriate, is standards driven, and motivates students to learn;
 - (5) use a range of instructional strategies, appropriate to the content area, to make subject matter accessible to all students;
 - (6) differentiate instruction, aligning methods and techniques to diverse student needs, including acceleration, remediation, and implementation of individual education plans;
 - (7) ensure that the learning environment features a high degree of student engagement by facilitating discussion and student-centered activities as well as leading direct instruction;

- (8) set high expectations and create challenging learning experiences for students, encouraging them to apply disciplinary and cross-disciplinary knowledge to real-world problems;
- (9) provide opportunities for students to engage in individual and collaborative critical thinking and problem solving:
- (10) monitor and assess students' progress to ensure that their lessons meet students' needs;
- (11) provide immediate feedback to students in order to reinforce their learning and ensure that they understand key concepts; and
- (12) adjust content delivery in response to student progress through the use of developmentally appropriate strategies that maximize student engagement.
- (c) Knowledge of Student and Student Learning. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers work to ensure high levels of learning and achievement outcomes for all students, taking into consideration each student's educational and developmental backgrounds and focusing on each student's needs. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) create a community of learners in an inclusive environment that views differences in learning and background as educational assets;
 - (2) connect learning, content, and expectations to students' prior knowledge, life experiences, and interests in meaningful contexts;
 - (3) understand the unique qualities of students with exceptional needs, including disabilities and giftedness, and know how to effectively address these needs through instructional strategies and resources;
 - (4) understand the role of language and culture in learning and know how to modify their practice to support language acquisition so that language is comprehensible and instruction is fully accessible; and
 - (5) understand how learning occurs and how learners develop, construct meaning, and acquire knowledge and skills.
- (d) Content Knowledge and Expertise. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers exhibit an understanding of content and related pedagogy as demonstrated through the quality of the design and execution of lessons and the ability to match objectives and activities to relevant state standards. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) keep current with developments, new content, new approaches, and changing methods of instructional delivery within their discipline;
 - (2) organize curriculum to facilitate student understanding of the subject matter;
 - (3) understand, actively anticipate, and adapt instruction to address common misunderstandings and preconceptions;
 - (4) promote literacy and the academic language within the discipline and make discipline-specific language accessible to all learners; and
 - (5) teach both the key content knowledge and the key skills of the discipline.
- (e) Learning Environment. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers interact with students in respectful ways at all times, maintaining a physically and emotionally safe, supportive learning environment that is characterized by efficient and effective routines, clear expectations for student behavior, and organization that maximizes student learning. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) embrace students' backgrounds and experiences as an asset in their learning;
 - (2) maintain and facilitate respectful, supportive, positive, and productive interactions with and among students;
 - implement behavior management systems to maintain an environment where all students can learn effectively;

- (4) maintain a culture that is based on high expectations for student performance and encourages students to be self-motivated, taking responsibility for their own learning;
- (5) maximize instructional time, including managing transitions; and
- (6) communicate regularly, clearly, and appropriately with parents and families about student progress, providing detailed and constructive feedback and partnering with families in furthering their students' achievement goals.
- (f) Data-Driven Practices. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers use formal and informal methods to assess student growth aligned to instructional goals and course objectives and regularly review and analyze multiple sources of data to measure student progress and adjust instructional strategies and content delivery as needed. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) gauge student progress and ensure mastery of content knowledge and skills by providing

 assessments aligned to instructional objectives and outcomes that are accurate measures of student learning;
 - (2) analyze and review data in a timely, thorough, accurate, and appropriate manner, both individually and with colleagues, to monitor student learning; and
 - (3) design instruction, change strategies, and differentiate their teaching practices to improve student learning based on assessment outcomes.
- (g) Professional Practices and Responsibilities. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers consistently hold themselves to a high standard for individual development, collaborate with other educational professionals, communicate regularly with stakeholders, maintain professional relationships, comply with all campus and school district policies, and conduct themselves ethically and with integrity. Grades 4-8 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) reflect on their own strengths and professional learning needs, using this information to develop action plans for improvement;
 - (2) seek out feedback from supervisor, coaches, and peers and take advantage of opportunities for jobembedded professional development;
 - (3) adhere to the educators' code of ethics in §247.2 of this title (relating to Code of Ethics and Standard Practices for Texas Educators), including following policies and procedures at their specific school placement(s); and
 - (4) communicate consistently, clearly, and respectfully with all members of the campus community, administrators, and staff.

§235.59. Implementation Date, Grades 4-8.

The provisions of this subchapter apply to an applicant who is admitted to an educator preparation program for the Classroom Teacher Certificate on or after September 1, 2018.

Subchapter D. Secondary School Certificate Standards

§235.61. Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Standards, Grades 7-12.

- (a) Grades 7-12 pedagogy and professional responsibilities (PPR) standards. The PPR standards identified in this section are targeted for classroom teachers of students in Grades 7-12. The standards address the discipline that deals with the theory and practice of teaching to inform skill-based training and development. The standards inform proper teaching techniques, strategies, teacher actions, teacher judgements, and decisions by taking into consideration theories of learning, understandings of students and their needs, and the backgrounds and interests of individual students. The standards are also aligned with the Commissioner's Teacher Standards in 19 TAC Chapter 149 of this title (relating to Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards).
- (b) Instructional Planning and Delivery. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers demonstrate understanding of instructional planning and delivery by providing standards-based, data-driven, differentiated instruction

- that engages students and makes learning relevant for today's learners. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers must:
- (1) develop lessons that build coherently toward objectives based on course content, curriculum scope and sequence, and expected student outcomes;
- (2) effectively communicate goals, expectations, and objectives to help all students reach high levels of achievement;
- (3) connect students' prior understanding and real-world experiences to new content and contexts, maximizing learning opportunities;
- (4) plan instruction that is developmentally appropriate, is standards driven, and motivates students to learn;
- (5) use a range of instructional strategies, appropriate to the content area, to make subject matter accessible to all students;
- (6) differentiate instruction, aligning methods and techniques to diverse student needs, including acceleration, remediation, and implementation of individual education plans;
- (7) ensure that the learning environment features a high degree of student engagement by facilitating discussion and student-centered activities as well as leading direct instruction;
- (8) set high expectations and create challenging learning experiences for students, encouraging them to apply disciplinary and cross-disciplinary knowledge to real-world problems;
- (9) provide opportunities for students to engage in individual and collaborative critical thinking and problem solving:
- (10) monitor and assess students' progress to ensure that their lessons meet students' needs;
- (11) provide immediate feedback to students in order to reinforce their learning and ensure that they understand key concepts; and
- (12) adjust content delivery in response to student progress through the use of developmentally appropriate strategies that maximize student engagement.
- (c) Knowledge of Student and Student Learning. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers work to ensure high levels of learning and achievement outcomes for all students, taking into consideration each student's educational and developmental backgrounds and focusing on each student's needs. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) create a community of learners in an inclusive environment that views differences in learning and background as educational assets;
 - (2) accept responsibility for the growth of all of their students, persisting in their efforts to ensure high levels of growth on the part of each learner;
 - (3) connect learning, content, and expectations to students' prior knowledge, life experiences, and interests in meaningful contexts;
 - (4) understand the unique qualities of students with exceptional needs, including disabilities and giftedness, and know how to effectively address these needs through instructional strategies and resources;
 - (5) understand the role of language and culture in learning and know how to modify their practice to support language acquisition so that language is comprehensible and instruction is fully accessible; and
 - (6) understand how learning occurs and how learners develop, construct meaning, and acquire knowledge and skills.

- (d) Content Knowledge and Expertise. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers exhibit an understanding of content and related pedagogy as demonstrated through the quality of the design and execution of lessons and the ability to match objectives and activities to relevant state standards. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) keep current with developments, new content, new approaches, and changing methods of instructional delivery within their discipline;
 - (2) organize curriculum to facilitate student understanding of the subject matter;
 - (3) understand, actively anticipate, and adapt instruction to address common misunderstandings and preconceptions;
 - (4) promote literacy and the academic language within the discipline and make discipline-specific language accessible to all learners; and
 - (5) teach both the key content knowledge and the key skills of the discipline.
- (e) Learning Environment. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers interact with students in respectful ways at all times, maintaining a physically and emotionally safe, supportive learning environment that is characterized by efficient and effective routines, clear expectations for student behavior, and organization that maximizes student learning. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) embrace students' backgrounds and experiences as an asset in their learning;
 - (2) maintain and facilitate respectful, supportive, positive, and productive interactions with and among students;
 - implement behavior management systems to maintain an environment where all students can learn effectively;
 - (4) maintain a culture that is based on high expectations for student performance and encourages students to be self-motivated, taking responsibility for their own learning;
 - (5) maximize instructional time, including managing transitions; and
 - (6) communicate regularly, clearly, and appropriately with parents and families about student progress, providing detailed and constructive feedback and partnering with families in furthering their students' achievement goals.
- (f) Data-Driven Practices. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers use formal and informal methods to assess student growth aligned to instructional goals and course objectives and regularly review and analyze multiple sources of data to measure student progress and adjust instructional strategies and content delivery as needed. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) gauge student progress and ensure mastery of content knowledge and skills by providing

 assessments aligned to instructional objectives and outcomes that are accurate measures of student
 learning;
 - (2) analyze and review data in a timely, thorough, accurate, and appropriate manner, both individually and with colleagues, to monitor student learning; and
 - (3) design instruction, change strategies, and differentiate their teaching practices to improve student learning based on assessment outcomes.
- (g) Professional Practices and Responsibilities. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers consistently hold themselves to a high standard for individual development, collaborate with other educational professionals, communicate regularly with stakeholders, maintain professional relationships, comply with all campus and school district policies, and conduct themselves ethically and with integrity. Grades 7-12 classroom teachers must:
 - (1) reflect on their own strengths and professional learning needs, using this information to develop action plans for improvement;
 - (2) seek out feedback from supervisor, coaches, and peers and take advantage of opportunities for jobembedded professional development;

- adhere to the educators' code of ethics in §247.2 of this title (relating to Code of Ethics and Standard Practices for Texas Educators), including following policies and procedures at their specific school placement(s);
- (4) communicate consistently, clearly, and respectfully with all members of the campus community, administrators, and staff; and
- (5) serve as advocates for their students, focusing attention on students' needs and concerns and maintaining thorough and accurate student records.

§235.89. Implementation Date, Grades 7-12.

The provisions of this subchapter apply to an applicant who is admitted to an educator preparation program for the Classroom Teacher Certificate on or after September 1, 2018.

ATTACHMENT III

Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee, Summary of Selection Process, and Updated Activities

Summary of Selection Process:

Nomination forms for participation on the Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee were first sent to all SBEC members on May 18th asking for outstanding educators, with an emphasis on current classroom teachers. The nomination forms required candidates to include evidence of measurable student achievement, years of experience, and professional development attended and presented, along with other pertinent information about their teaching assignment. The goal with the selection process was to emphasize diversity in the areas of grade-level, content, areas of expertise, years of experience, geographical representation, student backgrounds, and ethnic representation. After a thorough review process, TEA identified 71 committee members sub-divided across the three grade bands, representing over 38 school districts (including urban, rural, and suburban), 14 different Education Service Center regions across the state, and 13 different institutions of higher learning and educational organizations. SBEC approved the committee at the June 9, 2017 meeting.

SBEC's Charge to Committee:

TEA staff began the work with the committee by sharing:

- The purpose of the SBEC: to regulate and oversee all aspects of the certification, continuing education, and standards of conduct of public school educators to ensure all candidates for certification demonstrate the knowledge and skills necessary to improve the performance of all students;
- SBEC's mission: to ensure the highest level of educator preparation to promote student achievement and to ensure the safety and welfare of Texas school children; and
- The charge from SBEC at the March 2017 meeting: to develop a comprehensive plan to address any opportunities for improvement in the current educator certificate structure for the Board's consideration.

Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee:

Grades EC - 3: Subcommittee

Name	Title	District/Organization	Region
Alexander, Joseph	Principal	Waco ISD	12
Ashley, Allison	Teacher	Austin ISD	13
Bradshaw, Annah	Teacher	Northwest ISD	11
Brown, Amanda	Teacher	Austin ISD	13
Brown, David	Prof. of Early Childhood Education	Texas A&M University-Commerce	10
Church-Lang, Jessica	Asst. Prof. of Psychology	The University of Texas at Austin	13
Cockrum, Chelsea	Teacher	Grand Prairie ISD	10

Name	Title	District/Organization	Region
Cogburn, Robin	Teacher	Judson	20
Cole, Shannon	Principal	Grapevine Colleyville ISD	11
Edwards, Ceri	Teacher	Schertz-Cibolo-Universal City ISD	20
Garza, Julie	Teacher	Edinburg CISD	1
Hamman, Doug	Faculty and Administrator	Texas Tech University	18
Hill, Holly Baker	Implementation Specialist K-5 Literacy	San Antonio ISD	20
Holcomb, Tameka	Teacher	Alvin ISD	4
Kofron, Kim	Senior Program Director	TX Association for the Education of Young Children	13
Miller, Sherry	Teacher	Kileen ISD	12
Montoya, Maria	Teacher	Dallas ISD	10
Oliver, Tiffanye	PK Coordinator	Hillsboro ISD	12
Reed, Beverly	Senior Manager Provider Engagements	Collaborative for Children	4
Rodriguez, Jose	Teacher	Leander ISD	13
Summerville, Cody	Teacher	Pflugerville ISD	13
Uptain, Wendy	Manager of Advocacy	The Commit Partnership	10
Valdez, Selena	Teacher	North East ISD	20
White, Monica	Teacher	San Antonio ISD	20
White, Rhoda	Superintendent	Clifton ISD	12
Woerner, Kimberly	Teacher	Medina Valley	20

Grades 4 – 8: Subcommittee

Name	Title	District/Organization	Region
Braswell, Marci	Principal	Ricardo ISD	2
Bujan, Shelby Ottley	Teacher	Austin ISD	13
Eggleston, Jannie	Teacher	Klein ISD	4
Garcia, Nick	Senior Managing Director	Teach for America	20
James, Julia	Teacher	Spring ISD	4,

Name	Title	District/Organization	Region
Lofters, Andrew	Program Director	Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board	13
McMahon, Lorie	Teacher	Panther Creek ISD	15
Muniz, Jacqueline	Teacher	South Texas ISD	1
Oeser, Kelvey	Partner	The New Teacher Project	13
Perez, Sarah	Teacher	San Antonio ISD	20
Phillips, Stephanie	Teacher	Frenship ISD	17
Pierce, Dennis	CTE Coordinator	Klein ISD	4
Pirtle, Elizabeth	Teacher	North East ISD	20
Rodriguez-Tovar, Rodrigo	Teacher	Austin ISD	13
Segura, Jennifer Belchi	Teacher	Dallas ISD	10
Siemonsma, Alayna	Teacher	Conroe	6
Steeber, Robert	Chief of Human Capital	Grand Prairie ISD	10
Stoebe, Stephanie	Teacher	Round Rock ISD	13
Telese, James	Prof of Mathematics Education	The University of Texas Rio Grande Valley	1
Vincent, Rhonda	Dir. of Educational Training	Momentous Institute	10
Wahlert, Melodie	Educational Consultant	ESC Region 11	11
Walker, Kelley Sue	Teacher	Grapevine Colleyville ISD	11

Grades 7 – 12: Subcommittee

Name	Title	District/Organization	Region
Alfaro, Frank	Asst. Superintendent	Alamo Heights ISD	20
Anderson, Lauren	Teacher	Bloomburg ISD	8
Burke, Angela	Teacher	Dallas ISD	10
Conlon, Jessica	Partner	The New Teacher Project	13
Cunningham, Garry	Teacher	Wichita Falls ISD	9
Dale Jensen	Teacher	Clear Creek ISD	4

Name	Title	District/Organization	Region
Davis, Aicha	Teacher	DeSoto ISD	10
Fleenor, Elmer	Teacher	Taft ISD	2
Fraser, Chris	Senior Dean	Relay Graduate School of Education	4
Gonzales Jr., Jose	Teacher	Levelland ISD	5
Ham, Lisa	Dir of Instructional Tech	Highland Park ISD	10
Hill, Dorris	Teacher	Grand Prairie ISD	10
Howard, Carrie	Teacher	Petersburg ISD	17
Hunt, Teresa	Teacher	Seymour ISD	9
Kovacic, Kelly	Sr. Dir of Educator Initiatives	The Commit Partnership	10
Macha, Sarah	Teacher	New Caney ISD	6
Maphies, Alicia	Principal	Frisco ISD	10
Mata, Magdalena	Teacher	Alamo Heights ISD	20
McMahan, Angela	Teacher	Gregory - Portland ISD	2
Nelson-Archer, Michelle	Teacher	Fort-Bend ISD	4
Skidmore, Susana Troncoso	Assoc Prof of Educational Leadership	Sam Houston State Univ.	6
Wert, Linda	Career and Tech Ed Prog Coordinator	Klein ISD	4
West, Sandra	Assoc. Professor of Biology	Texas State University	13
White, Ashley	Campus Instructional Coach	Grapevine Colleyville ISD	11

Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities Update of Activities

May 2017

Because the current PPR standards are too narrow and are not prioritized for beginning teachers, TEA staff reviewed the existing Commissioner's Rules Concerning Educator Standards found in Chapter 149, Subchapter AA Teacher Standards as a starting place to ensure alignment as reflected in the Educator Certification Structure Redesign Framework. These 66 standards were created by a committee of Texas educators in 2013 and adopted into rule in 2014 with the intention of setting an aspirational bar for all teachers to strive. The desire to prioritize these standards by identifying the foundational competencies for a beginning or developing teacher is rooted in the belief that teaching is a complex endeavor and the knowledge, skills, and expertise develop over time through practice, reflection, and feedback. Sixty-six aspirational standards can seem overwhelming for a beginning teacher and many are unsure of what to work on first. The need to make recommendations on

how to strategically sequence and scaffold the standards for beginning teachers would be the chief responsibility of the Classroom Teacher Standards Advisory Committee.

June 9, 2017

SBEC approved the committee.

June 13, 2017

Once the committee was chosen, TEA staff conducted a webinar, and the committee members were assigned pre-work asking them to familiarize themselves with the Commissioner's Rules for Teacher Standards to internalize this vision of excellence for all teachers, as well as the T-TESS rubric, rooted in the Teacher Standards and used as the appraisal tool in over 90% of all Texas school districts, to serve as a guide for the progression of a teacher's development. Committee members were asked to focus their attention on the elements that distinguish a developing teacher to prioritize the standards for the narrower grade-banded approach to the Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities (PPR) standards. For supplemental reading, the committee members were given the publication *Fast Start* (2014) by TNTP and the High-leverage Practices by Teaching Works of the University of Michigan School of Education. These documents provide two different perspectives on the need to prioritize the foundational skills for beginning teachers.

After completing their pre-reading assignments, the committee members were then asked to prioritize half of the 66 Teacher Standards and provide rationale and specification for what each of those standards could look like within their grade band sub-committee. This activity was intended to force committee members to reflect on what are the essential foundational skills a developing teacher needs to focus on in their preparation and what that would look like within each of the narrower grade bands.

Once all the pre-work submissions were collected, each grade band facilitator "rolled-up" their data detailing which standards were the most frequently prioritized within their respective sub-committee. This data then served as the starting point for a discussion within each grade band sub-committee at the in-person committee meeting.

June 19, 2017

TEA staff conducted an in-person meeting held at the American Institutes of Research (AIR). Three staff members facilitated the committee and broke into three subcommittees. The committee members were encouraged to share their perspective, ask clarifying questions of each other, and engage in rich dialogue over which standards to prioritize. Committee members were then asked to review each other's specification examples and provide feedback to be used later in PPR test development.

After the in-person committees met as separate grade bands, the three facilitators shared their respective committee's prioritized standards, the highlights from each discussion, and then looked for similarities and differences across grade bands.

June 30, 2017	TEA staff sent out a second version of their prioritized list for another round of feedback.
July 25, 2017	TEA staff conducted a second webinar to review submitted feedback and next steps.
August 4, 2017	TEA staff presented advisory committee update and provided SBEC with next steps.
August 8, 2017	TEA staff informed the advisory committees of the content of the SBEC workday and board meeting.
October 6, 2017	TEA staff presented recommended PPR educator standards to SBEC for proposal and publication in the <i>Texas Register</i> . SBEC approved with no changes.
December 8, 2017	TEA staff presents recommended PPR educator standards to SBEC for adoption.
February 3, 2018	State Board of Education reviews SBEC-adopted PPR educator standards in new Chapter 235. (final step in the rulemaking process).